

# COMPARATIVE LABOR MOVEMENTS

## A Survey and Commentary

by

Prof. R. Hally

Visiting Associate Professor of Economics  
American University in Cairo

The emergence of many new nations with novel relationships between trade unions and workers and government, and the continuing evolution of these relationships in the developed countries has led to a number of attempts to rework the theories which purport to account for the appearance and functional role of trade unions.

The older theories advanced by the Webbs, Marx, Commons and others were conceived in the period of earlier capitalistic industrialization which was characterized by heavy pressures on wages from capitalistic competition, fluctuating wage levels, and overriding employer control of the economic system. (1)

Tannenbaum and Perlman, viewing principally the United States industrial environment, ascribed trade union origins to a lack of status and security generated by continuous job change associated with industrial development and the cycle-prone capitalist economy. (2)

In those capitalist countries where the labor movement became strong the labor leadership was primarily trade union oriented, directing the movement toward accommodation with industrial capitalism and secondarily toward social reform. The middle class intellectual, principally socialist in orientation, had an

- 
- (1) Karl Marx and Frederick Engels, «Communist Manifesto», in H.J. Laski, *Communist Manifesto: A Social Landmark*, (London: 1948), p. 130; Sidney and Beatrice Webb, *Industrial Democracy* (London: 1920), Chap. 15; John R. Commons et al, *History of Labour in the United States*, Vol. I (New York: MacMillan Co. (1919), pp. 5—21; Frank Tannenbaum, *The Labor Movement* (New York G. P. Putnam and Sons, Roickerboker Press, 1921) pp. 6—7; Selig Perlman *Theory of the Labor Movement* (New York: Augustus M. Kelley, 1949) pp. 6—7.
- (2) Frank Tannenbaum, *The Labor Movement* (New York: G.P. Putnam and Sons, Knickerbocker Press, 1921) pp. 6—7, Selig Perlman), *Theory of the Labor Movement*, (New York; Augustus M. Kelley, 1949) pp. 6—7.

insignificant position in the United States union movement and an auxiliary but not decisive influence in the functioning of the trade unions in most Western European countries in the formative years of trade unionism. However, one must not ignore the complexity of the labor movement. Cole has pointed out that one must take account of the cooperative society, the political party or activity, and the socialist facets of the labor movements in spite of the fact that trade unions have been the earliest and most persistent form of the labor movement. (3) These Western trade unions went through a long period of experimentation with other modes of accommodation to capitalism and with frequent failures, before the development of the trade union and collecting bargaining as the principal vehicle for maintaining and improving the conditions of their working lives and giving them a better status in both industry and society.

Trade unions have remained strong in the advanced capitalist economies in spite of the appearance of labor-socialist governments, a significant modification of industry ownership and a new emphasis on economic growth. This has strengthened the belief among some Western writers that trade unions are a fundamental institution for worker success in improving their conditions both in the industrialized and industrializing economies. (4)

In line with the above view, Kerr and Siegel have recently advanced a theory of trade union function that generalizes beyond economies that are predominantly private enterprise. (5) Using a model which is appropriate for differing kinds of leadership and stages of industrialization, they postulate that the work environment unilaterally imposes a web of rules on the worker. He responds with an organization appropriate for the participation in the rule-making process. Rule-making response varies with leadership and stage. Rule-making mobilizes the working force for industrialization and minimizes the worker protest to industrial discipline. The variation in rule-making patterns include employer-

(3) G.D.H. Cole, *A. Short History of the British Working Class Movement, 1787-1947*, (George Allen and Unwin, London: 1952) pp. 6-7.

(4) Clark Kerr and Others, *Industrialism and Industrial Man* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1960).

(5) Clark Kerr and Abraham Siegel, «The Structuring of the Labor Force in Industrial Society: New Dimensions and New Questions», *Industrial and Labor Relations Review* VIII (January 1955) p. 163.

established rules with paternalism, worker set rules as in producer cooperatives or worker councils, and state established rules. In addition dualistic and pluralistic systems in which this power is shared by workers, employers, and the state is characteristic of the developed Western economies.

Suffrin has suggested that trade unions have an ideology or set of values that both integrate with the ultimate utopia goals of the national state and are operationally consistent with the social and economic structures constructed by the national state along the path of the ultimate utopian purpose. (6) Both the goals and structures are apt to be quite unique in each developing national state. Trade unions in many of the new national states have developed value system appropriate to throwing off colonial rule or formulating utopian goals. If trade unions are to survive they must develop value systems which consist with immediate realities of the economic structures utilized by the national state to move towards their ultimate goals. Specifically, the labor leadership must try to satisfy the claims of the union membership without transgressing the demands of their political partnership in facilitating measures appropriate to the rapid economic development goal held by both. (7)

The causal factors in the recent appearance of trade unions in many countries still on the threshold of industrialization have also been reexamined. Ghosh suggests that some trade union growth in the mixed economies is a response to the reduction in either consumption or the marginal propensity to consume that is associated with the rapid formation under some degree of forced industrialization. (8) Under socialist industrialization spontaneous worker movements are apt to appear only if consumption declines significantly or consumption gains are denied over a considerable period of time. However, a socialist sharing of austerity among all social groups and a positive role for worker groups is apt to make workers cooperative.

---

(6) Sidney C. Suffrin, *Unions in Emerging Societies*, (Syracuse, New York: Syracuse University Press, 1964), pp. 45-47.

(7) Bruce H. Milen, *The Political Role of Labor in the Developing countries* (Washington, D.C.: The Brookings Institution, 1963), Chap. 5.

(8) Subrathesh Ghosh, *Trade Unionism in the Underdeveloped Countries* (Calcutta: Bookland Private, 1960), pp. 21-23.

Knowles finds trade unions appearing in the new nations earlier and in larger numbers than in the developed nations. (9) Preindustrial unrest is the basis for some union development. Preindustrial unrest has a long history in the underdeveloped countries as a result of the penetration of Western culture and activities into them, bringing social disintegration. Unrest has become particularly acute in recent years as the awareness of the possibilities of social and economic advance became widespread. Among the specific factors which led to unrest are under- and unemployment, urban slums appears with rising population pressure and rapid urbanization, deficiencies in community provision for education, recreation, and social activities, poorly developed credit, facilities fostering continuing debt and usury, land feudalism and race and status distinctions. Wage workers employed principally by indigeneous capitalists in small trade and manufacturing establishments and on plantations by both foreign and native owners are upset by difficult working condition but hindered from responding by surplus labor.

In addition, more literate white-collar groups protest against discrimination, feudalism, colonialism and for economic development. This unrest led to trade union organization principally among transportation, plantation, civil service and those handicraft workers displaced by factory production.

A strong impetus has been given to trade union organization in developing countries by external forces. Middle class intellectuals have sought organized worker support for nationalism, political power and economic development. Some colonial powers encouraged the establishment of Western collective-bargaining unions partly to divert workers from political channels. Finally the two ideologically opposed international federation of trade unions have been postwar rivals in trade unions organization in many of the emerging nations. (10)

Today, trade union development does not appear to be associated as closely with the process of industrialization as in earlier capitalistic economies because in many instances they are

---

(9) William H. Knowles, *Industrial Conflict and Unions*, in Wilbert E. Moore and Arnold S. Feldman, *Labor Commitment and Social Change in Developing Areas* (New York: Social Science Research Council, 1960), pp. 299—304.

(10) Millin, pp. 66—67.

viewed as agencies for the industrializing and nation building process. As a result trade unions are universally accepted as a useful socio-economic institution. Present economic theories accounting for their origin and function are inadequate because they are either too broad and mechanical or inapplicable to the wide range of national structural pattern and goals.

Let us consider some of the significant changes that are taking place in the characted and the functioning of the trade union movement in the developed countries. While trade union membership has increased rapidly in the post-World War II period in many of the developing countries. Trade union membership has fallen as a proportion of the wage and salary labor force in many of them. Some observers have talked of a trade union crisis in a number of Western countries. Nevertheless unions remain strong and continue to function as strong protagonists to business and government management in collective bargaining and to be a force for continuing social reform and improvement of the industrial position of the worker through favorable laws.

The cause of the current trade union malaise varies among these countries but may be attributed to some of the following factors. Prosperity and strong employer opposition reduces both the workers tendencies and opportunity to join unions. Weak union organization among the rapidly expanding white collar worker hinders trade union growth in some countries. Ideological schisms have weakened trade unions in a number of Western countries — notably France, Italy and Finland. Finally, legislation has reduced the scope of activities that unions have exercised is serving worker interests. A number of observers feel that these factors will be only transitory and that the deleterious effect of rapid technological change on job security will present a new challenge and strengthen unions.

Even in the developed capitalist countries, trade unions seek to enhance the status and economic welfare of worker with a variety of new organizational structures and policy positions. Trade unions in countries which have in the past depended almost exclusively on collective bargaining for the improvement of economic welfare, the United States i.e., have been forced to assign a larger role to political activities while in some European countries, Italy and Great Britain i.e., unions are making a greater use of collective bargain. A third group of countries especially

Scandinavian, have maintained for some years a finely balanced pluralistic industrial relations system with government, unions and business participation.

While United States trade unions continue to rely principally on labor-management collective bargaining, a greater commitment to political action can be observed recently. This has three aspects. First, trade unions have shifted their support increasingly to one of the majority political parties. Second, the steady increase in legislative enactments relating to labor and informal government pressure to limit wage gain through collective bargaining has made it necessary for unions to exert greater political effort. Finally, the trade unions find it necessary to protect their position by legislating minimum wage and employment standards for the 75 per cent of wage and salary workers who are not in unions or employed by government. The trend toward a greater but not decisive role for political action is unmistakable in the United States. American trade unions remain ideologically private enterprise and very mildly reformist.

The strong ideological schisms and fervor that enveloped most European labor movements in the immediate post-World War II, have receded. Legislated reforms favorable to labor, high rates of national income growth, and the participation of trade unions in government have significantly improved their economic position and status. France and Italy remain notable exceptions to this trend and the unique mix of political, economic and social forces in the labor movement of the latter country has caused it to be considered a prototype of labor movements in many of the emerging countries. (11)

In several European countries a greater emphasis on collective bargaining at the local plant level has appeared, stemming from the "wage drift" of recent years. (12) Traditionally, in a

---

(11) Maurice F. Neudfeld, «The Inevitability of Political Unionism in Underdeveloped Countries: Italy the Exemplar», *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, Vol. 13 (April 1960) p.

(12) See Arthur M. Ross, «Prosperity and British Industrial Relations», *Industrial Relations* Vol. 3 (February 1963) pp. 63—66.

The wage drift is the gap between negotiated minimum wage rates and the wages actually paid in the individual plant. Large wage drifts have been noted in both Great Britain and Italy.

number of these countries wages bargains have set only a minimum wage that is uniform for a large group of industries as a defense against wage cuts. High employment, competition for labor and rising product demand has permitted employer to establish unilaterally better wages and working conditions. Union federation are strengthening the local unit to recapture control of wage setting in the local firm.

Finally a loosening of the close association between trade union federation and their political party affiliation has been noted. However, trade unions of the West while having an institutional role of their own, by and large have had to operate through political parties which they hope to influence or strongly control. The political role, however, still remains the secondary weapon for obtaining upward wages and working conditions.

A brief review of the history of Soviet Union trade unions is useful in this discussion to show the changes in their function in the industrialization processes of the most advanced Marxian socialist state. Because of Czarist repression trade unions appeared in substantial numbers in the Soviet Union coincident with the Revolution of 1917. Their orientation was strongly political in an economy which was primarily peasant and agricultural and chaotic for a number of years. They undertook a number of unique functions such as participating in the operation of the industrial enterprises, registering and distributing labor, establishing wages and enforcing the general obligation to work.

In the mixed economy that existed until 1929 trade unions were expected to protect workers in private firms through wage setting and collective bargaining as well as protect the workers from arbitrary bureaucracy in the socialized industry sector. This role was thought necessary because of the increasing emphasis on "commercial accounting" (profitability and efficiency in industry through the 1920's coupled with the surplus of labor that existed in the USSR until the initiation of the first five years plan. During the period, the adoption of the principle of individual management reduced the participation by unions in the wage setting process, in goods rationing and worker distribution. In addition, trade unions attitudes toward profitable private industry was ambivalent. Should trade unions exact higher wages than in

---

(13) Isaac Deutscher, «Russia» in Walter Galenson *Comparative Labor Movements* (New York: Prentice Hall Inc., 1955) pp. 480—574.

less profitable government enterprise or assume a productionist viewpoint and eschew strikes for better working conditions? The position of trade unions was further reduced by the growth of state industry and the planning organization.

The Bolshevik party had assumed that while there might be conflict between the proletariat democracy (as represented by trade unions) and capitalists and peasantry, it would not arise between proletariat dictatorship and proletariat democracy. However, as the Bolshevik leadership reduced, the role of trade unions conflict appeared. For example, a system of arbitration for labor disputes which had been established under the Commissioner of Labor a trade union appointee, gradually shift to de facto control of the Party. Thus the trade union leadership came frequently in conflict with the economic administration, the Party and its own rank and file. Yet, the trade union movement was to be the mass base for the Communist Party in the essentially agrarian society.

The position of the trade union movement change significant with the imitation of the first five years plan. The functions of trade unions were diminished and the leadership of the unions was changed partly because they had supported a plan for industrialization at a lower rate which favored worker living standards.

Trade unions retained the administration of the social security laws and were directed by the state to train and assist the procurement of workers, establish technical and general education schools in the factory, reduce labor turn over as labor came to be in short supply and administer the shock worker and Stakhanov program of socialist emulation. The collective bargaining agreement between the enterprise unit and the trade union disappeared in 1934 and was not used again until 1947 when it was reinitiated with a pro-forma character. The trade Union Congress did not meet between 1939 and 1949.

While trade union membership was voluntary for the industrial proletariat, the trade union is the principal mass organization in the Soviet Union and the principles for enlisting member-

(14) Solomon M. Schwarz, «Trade Unions in the Soviet Union», *Current History* Vol. 37 (August 1959) pp. 81—2.

(15) Emily Clark Brown, «Interest and Rights of Soviet Industrial Workers and the Revolution of Conflicts», *Industrial and Labor Relations Review* Vol. 16 (January 1963) pp. 254—264.

ship include coercion and persuasion. Most workers in the larger enterprise belong to trade unions. First unions are an avenue to advancement into the Communist Party and to positions in the trade union hierarchy. Second, social security benefits have been larger for union members. Third, workers are encouraged to join and by doing so they have a voice in industrial relations.

Since 1953 a number of changes have been made in the position of Soviet trade unions. In conformity with Soviet labor law and the requirements of the plan, a collective agreement is negotiated between the factory trade union committee and management. The agreement specifies the manner in which law and the plan apply in the factory. The factor committee handles grievances concerning discipline, worker, safety, promotion, incorrect wages, social security, benefits, vacation rights, the allocation of housing, etc. for the worker. Both production-minded managers and erring workers are to be held to the law and agreement by action of the trade union and through appeal to the union hierarchy.

At the present time, Soviet trade unions are considered to be public, not governmental bodies representing the workers for labor, cultural and daily life activities. The trade union hierarchy represents the trade union membership to the state organization and has participated in the recent revisions of wage statutes and labor laws. Undoubtedly the views of the workers are heard by governmental organization through the interlacing of party membership in the trade unions and state organizations as well as by worker complaints in the Soviet press. It has been suggested that the activities of the trade unions will increase as the rights and duties of both management and workers become better defined and understood.

This brief review suggests that Soviet trade unions have had a changing function in the industrialization process. Initially they performed as economic administrators to protect workers and productionist tasks. From 1929 to 1953 productionist and labor force mobilization activities were central in their activities. Recently, worker representation has supplemented their productionist activities.

Yugoslavia has experimented with its governmental structure and industrial organization liberally in its few years as a Socialist

state. Compared to the Soviet Union its industrialization was decided less advanced when it began its experience under socialism. Therefore, economic structure in addition to ideology has dictated a somewhat different role for the trade union in Yugoslavia.

Trade unions initially performed much the same functions as in the Soviet Union, namely as an organ of the state and party to foster production efforts of labor in industry. However, two organizations were introduced into the institutional structure of Yugoslavia that makes the trade union position different than in the Soviet Union. First the Socialist Alliance functions as the mass organization to enlist the support of and mobilize citizens who are generally in support of the Socialist movement. Second the workers' council, which represents all workers in the enterprise, directs the enterprise unit. The trade unions also function in the enterprise but not as the exclusive organization for the workers. However, the League of Communists operates in the workers' council and trade union in fashion analogous to the role of the Communist Party in the Soviet Union. The considerable decentralization of economic decision making in Yugoslavia appears to demand a significant emphasis on persuasion and leadership by the League of Communists.

The rights, duties and earnings of the Yugoslav industrial worker are established by the worker and other industry and state organization. The strong influence of the Workers' Council in the appointment and retention of the enterprise director and the administration of the firm has removed the trade union from the traditional role of protecting worker rights. It would appear that the typical trade union agreement is superfluous under such an arrangement. (16)

The high rate of turnover in workers councils — one third must be replaced at each election — and the lack of worker sophistication in management practices led to trade union preparation of elections listed prior to 1958 and emphasis on stimulating production in the production unit. The local Sindikat (trade union) has a production committee whose primary function is to serve the productionist role through pressure on the workers council. The production role of the committee includes curbing exclusive

---

(16) Fred W. Neale, *Titoism in Action* (Berkeley; University of California Press, 1958) pp. 135-36, 244-246.

worker orientation in the workers council, fighting for production increases and raising the level of efficiency of the enterprise. In contrast to the Soviet trade union, its Yugoslav counterpart is considered to be an organ of the State and is represented on governmental units. Unions operate at the local level to oversee the local enterprise because of its intimate acquaintance with its progress. At this level, its membership includes nearly every League of Communist worker in the plant as well as most members of workers' councils. Thus the Trade Union seeks to direct the activities of the economic unit by seeing that its membership includes the worker leadership group.

At the national level, trade unions participate in setting work norms and other factors which establish some uniformity of earning levels in the decentralized economy. Finally they perform a variety of educational, training, and recruiting duties to assist in upgrading industrial workers and moving agriculturalists to industry. It would appear that the Yugoslav trade union will remain a key institution for economic control if the present economic decentralization continues. Its membership is apt to expand at the same pace that industrial units grows. (17)

Pakistan appears to represent a case history of stalemated union development and function. Since 1950 union membership has not increased significantly nor have unions been able to secure significant gains in wages, welfare, control working conditions or maintain union discipline. Nor have Pakistan unions played the usual political role of trade unions as in that of the emerging countries. However, one element has appeared in Pakistani industrial relations which is common in many of the emerging state and that is the labor courts with arbitration functions.

After partition of India, in 1947, a reorganization of Pakistan trade unions began. At that time there were few trade unions in Pakistan industries. By 1949 four national labor federations had been formed from local unions. These trade unions were principally among transport workers, in post and telegraph and textile and metal workers, all sources of union strength in most developing countries. The two strong federations were the All Pakistani

---

(17) Branko Horvat and Vlado Roscovic «Worker's Councils in Yugoslavia: A comment», *Journal of Political Economy* Vol. 67 (April 1959) p. 195; Benjamin Ward, «A Reply», p. 199.

Confederation of Labor with branches in East and West Pakistan and the Pakistan Trade Union Federation. Trade unions were subject to the 1926 (India) trade union Act which required registration of the union in order for it to be recognized officially by the employer. Registered union membership totalled about 160,000 in 1948-49 but actual membership was probably higher.

After 1950, Trade Union membership increased further through organizational efforts by the Pakistan Trade Union Federation and the Moslem League. The Federation, under extreme left wing control and endorsing a program of thoroughgoing nationalization of industry suffered a split in leadership followed by a government ban on communist activities which removed much of its leadership.

At the same time the All Pakistani Confederation of Labor abandoned Union constitutional provisions permitting political affiliation and declaring for reformist socialism. While political party interest in a labor base of support stopped in a couple of years because of the growing employer disfavor, political activities of unions ended in 1958 with the declaration of nation wide Martial Law. The adverse factors reduced trade union membership from an estimated 400,000 in 1951 to 300,000 in 1956. (18)

The trade disputes act of 1958 was amended in 1960 and 1961 to give trade unions a slightly stronger position in the industrial scene. These amendments provide for compulsory employer recognition of registered trade unions with an industrial court to enforce employer acceptance of trade unions. The Act included a requirement that union officers come from the industry which changed the practice, common in most trade union movements of developing countries, of electing middle class leadership. This requirement probably will reduce temporarily the effectiveness of unions since there are few literate and trained leaders in unions and to date these men have hesitated to face the prospect of possible employer reprisals for union activity. Pakistan law also provides for "joint consultation" between work committees and employer representation concerning matters of common interest but these provisions seldom seem to be used. (19)

---

(18) Sufrin, pp. 58.

(19) Ghosh, p. 324.

It appears that the laws of 1960 and 1961 will do little to change the role of labor from that of a rather weak, unstable non-political trade union movement. The opposition of employers associations, the absences of strong trade union leadership, the agricultural ties of many workers, and the lack of political activity all contribute to trade union weakness. Since political action is usually the only instrument by which unions can improve the position of the worker in the face of strong employers and labor surpluses, trade unions are not apt to play a useful or significant role in the industrialization of Pakistan in the present industrial environment. It is notable that few new unions of those unregistered but in existences complied with registration for recognition following the passage of favorable legislation in 1960 and 1961. (20)

It has been pointed out that government suppression of left wing ideology in Pakistani trade unions has failed to transform unions into organizations with commitments similar to that of the government. The acceptance of a disciplined work habit has been lacking both because of the failure of union identification with government and poor relations with most employers. It appears that the utopia of the national state has not set forth in a pattern acceptable to labor nor has labor's short run ideology been prescribed. (21)

The Indonesian labor movement is prototypic of trade union characteristics and functioning in many other developing countries. Indonesian unions have generally stressed political activities and sought gains from government intervention rather than the use of economic pressure and collective bargaining. The union movement had to cope before World War II with a colonial government which did not encourage their establishment and against intransigent employers. More recently, union roles have been shaped by the need to find an ideology and institutional function consistent with the unique nationalistic "Guided Democracy" Indonesia.

---

(20) Sufrin, p. 63.

(21) See Wilfred Cantwell Smith, *Islam in Modern History* (New York; The New American Library, 1957) Chap. 5. He feels that Pakistan has been unable to build a programic institutional base on the religious ideas of an «Islamic State».

Indonesian workers had a strong political orientation from the inception of the first trade union in 1908 among railway workers. While a politically mildly conservative and organizational stable white collar, professional and civil service worker group affiliated itself with the Sarekat Islam organizations, most trade unions affiliated themselves with left wing revolutionary parties. Plantation workers were temporarily successful using economic pressure in winning wage increase in 1919 under affiliation with Sarekat Islam but failed to maintain their union after an unsuccessful strike. These workers and their affiliation shifted to weak left wing unions. By 1930, trade union growth reached to only about one percent of the labor force. Government repression for political activity, employer opposition, and the depression after 1930, reduced trade union strength in the next ten year.

Post World War II independence brought a resurgence of trade union organizational work both by workers and by political parties seeking to undergird themselves by acquiring mass labor support. The most successful organization was the Communist-oriented central Labor Organization of All Indonesia which by 1958 comprised only slightly less than one half of the total Indonesian Union membership of over 2 million workers. Three other trade union federations affiliated with Socialist, Moslem and Nationalist parties have substantial numbers of trade union affiliates. In 1958, total union membership represented not over 10 per cent of the non-agricultural labor force and was heavily concentrated on Java. Dues paying is intermittent and both individual members and trade union units shift their allegiance among the trade union federations.

Since 1957 union membership has not increased significantly. At that time Dutch property was nationalized, strikes were virtually prohibited by law and collective bargaining was given a diminished role. Other factors which have retarded union growth include a dampening of party rivalry which reduced their organizational efforts, a renewed emphasis on production and a government imposed wage pause to stem inflation.

The character of trade union activity began to change in 1951 with the inauguration of a system of disputes arbitration that eventually became compulsory. In 1957, Dutch property was sequestered and placed principally in the management of army personnel. This was accompanied by an extension of the ban on strikes to these industries.

The use of collective bargaining by Indonesian trade unions to improve wages has almost completely disappeared. Initially Indonesian law provided for the trade agreement and its enforcement if registered with the government. Since a significant part of the Indonesian worker's wages have traditionally been paid in food and textiles, the private sector's ability to give benefits to trade unions is limited by government distribution of these commodities. Furthermore, arbitration awards in private sector disputes have been tied to wages and benefits granted government controlled industries.

The political activities of Indonesian trade unions are being redirected and their affiliation with existing political parties is being loosened. The goal is to enlist their direct support behind a united front for the concept and institutions of the guided democracy. A number of attempts have been made to create a united labor movement. In 1960 a draft unification plan was accepted by some federations but rejected by the powerful and communist-oriented Central Labor Organization of All Indonesia. A new initiative by army managers of government enterprise led to the establishment of a united association of state employees. Workers have been given representation directly in the Indonesian parliament as one of the functional groups. At the same time trade union federations continued affiliation with political parties who are also represented in parliament.

Indonesian and Pakistani trade union development typifies that in many of the developing countries. In the colonial period trade union membership grew slowly and variations in ideology separated unions. After independence, trade union expansion was rapid for a time under favorable laws and with organizational help of political parties. For a time industrial relations systems usually borrowed from the West were utilized. As national states sought to define a new utopian objective, new political and industrial forms were forced on unions. Trade unions functions are also limited by legal enactment which provide social security, minimum wages and other types of production. Collective bargaining is restrained by weak unions or wages controls through compulsory arbitration system. The expansion of trade unions is halted awaiting the expansion of industry. Political activities are redirected.

In the Western countries industrial relationships systems and the political role of unions is well structured and changes slowly.

The industrial relations structure in the Soviet Union is also well established and will probably change slowly. However, in Yugoslavia, experimentation toward a unique industrial structure is apt to call for new trade union functions.

#### R E F E R E N C E S

1. Karl Marx and Frederick Engels. "A Communist Manifesto", in H. J. Laski; *Communist Manifesto: A Social Landmark* (London; 1948) p. 130; Sidney and Beatrice Webb, *Industrial Democracy* (London: 1920) Chap. 15; John R. Commons et al, *History of Labour in the United States*, Vol. I (New York: 1919) 3—21.
2. Frank Tannenbaum, *The Labor Movement* (New York: 1921) 6—7; Selig Perlman, *Theory of the Labor Movement* (New York: 1949) 6—7.
3. G.D.H. Cole, *A Short History of the British Working Class Movement, 1787-1947* (London: 1952) 6—7.
4. Clark Kerr et al, *Industrialism and Industrial Man* (Cambridge, Harvard University Press, 1960). This contains a very complete statement of this view.
5. Clark Kerr and Abraham Siegel, "The Structuring of the Labor Force in Industrial Society." *New Dimensions New Questions*, *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, Vol. 8 (January 1955) 163.
6. Sidney C. Sufrin, *Unions in Emerging Societies* (Syracuse, New York: 1964) 45—47.
7. Bruce H. Millen, *The Political Role of Labor in the Developing Countries* (Washington, D.C., 1963) 64—79.
8. Subrathesh Ghosh, *Trade Unionism in the Underdeveloped Countries* (Calcutta: 1960) 21—23.
9. William H. Knowles, "Industrial Conflict and Union", in Wilbert E. Moore and Arnold S. Feldman, *Labor Commitment and Social Change in Developing Areas* (New York: 1960) 299—304.
10. Millen, pp. 66—67.
11. Maurice F. Neufeld, "The Inevitability of Political Unionism in the Under Developed Countries, Italy the Exemplar." *In-*

- dustrial and Labor Relations Review*, Vol. 13 (April, 1960) 363—386.
12. See Arthur M. Ross, "Property and British Industrial Relations," *Industrial Relations*, Vol. 2 (February, 1963) 63—66. The wage drift is the gap between minimum wage rates and wages actually paid in the individual plants and have been noted in Great Britain, France and Italy.
  13. Isaac Deutscher, "Russia" in Walter Galenson, *Comparative Labor Movements* (New York: 1955) 480—574.
  14. Solomon M. Schwarz, "Trade Unions in the Soviet Union", *Current History*, Vol. 37, (August, 1959) 81—82.
  15. Emily Clark Brown, "Interests and Rights of Soviet Industrial Workers and the Resolution of Conflicts," *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, Vol. 16 (January, 1963) 254—264.
  16. Fred W. Neale, *Titoism in Action* (Berkeley: 1958) 135—136, 244—246.
  17. Branko Horvat and Vlado Roscovic, "Workers' Councils in Yugoslavia: A Comment," *Journal of Political Economy*, Vol. 47 (April, 1959) 195; Benjamin Ward, "A Reply", 199.
  18. Sufrin, 50—55.
  19. Ghosh, 524.
  20. Sufrin, 63.
  21. See Wilfred Cantwell, Smith, *Islam in Modern History* (New York: 1957), Chap. 5. Smith feels that Pakistan has been unable to build a pragmatic institutional base on the religious ideas of an "Islamic State".