

Title: Physician Deaths from Corona Virus Disease (COVID-19)

Authors: Edsel B. Ing, Alis (Qinyuan) Xu, Ali Salimi, Nurhan Torun

Affiliations: University of Toronto Ophthalmology, Staff, Toronto, Ontario Canada,
University of British Columbia, Medical Student, Vancouver, BC, Canada
McGill University, Medical Student, Montreal, QC, Canada
Harvard Beth Israel Deaconess, Ophthalmology Chief, Boston, MA, USA

Correspondence: Dr. Edsel Ing MD, FRCSC, MPH, CPH, MIAD

650 Sammon Ave, K306, Toronto, ON. M4C 5M5

Phone 416) 385-0718

Fax 416) 385-3880

Email: edingLidStrab@gmail.com

MD Death COVID-19

Funding: None

Conflicts of interest: None

Financial interests: None

REB / Permissions: Not required for publicly available online data

Keywords: COVID-19; coronavirus; physician; death

PRECIS:

Physicians from all medical specialties have died from COVID-19, but these fatalities are potentially preventable.

MD Death COVID-19

ABSTRACT

OBJECTIVE: The COVID-19 pandemic has caused much morbidity and mortality to patients but also health care providers. We tabulated the cases of physician deaths from COVID-19 associated with front-line work in hopes of mitigating future events.

METHOD: On April 5, 2020, Google internet search was performed using the keywords “doctor” “physician” “death” “COVID” “COVID-19” and “coronavirus” in English and Farsi, and in Chinese using the Baidu search engine.

RESULTS: We found 198 physician deaths from COVID-19, but complete details were missing for 49 individuals. The average age of the physicians that died was 63.4 years (range 28 to 90 years) and the median age was 66 years of age. Ninety percent of the deceased physicians were male (175/194). General practitioners and emergency room doctors (78/192), respiriologists (5/192), internal medicine specialists (11/192) and anesthesiologists (6/192) comprised 52% of those dying. Two percent of the deceased were epidemiologists (4/192), 2% were infectious disease specialists (4/192), 5% were dentists (9/192), 4% were ENT (8/192), and 4% were ophthalmologists (7/192). The countries with the most reported physician deaths were Italy (79/198), Iran (43/198), China (16/198), Philippines (14/198), United States (9/192) and Indonesia (7/192).

CONCLUSION: Physicians from all specialties may die from COVID, and these deaths will likely increase as the pandemic progresses. Lack of personal protective equipment was cited as a common cause of death. Consideration should be made to exclude older physicians from front-line work.

MD Death COVID-19

INTRODUCTION

The coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) pandemic has infected at least 1.2 million individuals worldwide with an overall 5.5% risk of death as of April 5, 2020.⁽¹⁾ Physicians caring for COVID-19 infected patients are at high risk of contagion and possible mortality. To quantify and mitigate this risk, the underlying characteristics of physician deaths from COVID infection are investigated.

METHOD

No research ethics board approval was required for this publicly available information.

On April 5, 2020, a Google internet search was performed using the keywords “doctor”, “physician”, “death”, “COVID”, “COVID-19” and “corona” in English, and repeated in Farsi. An additional search was performed on Baidu (the Chinese version of Google) using the equivalent Chinese characters. (see Appendix) An additional PubMed search was performed using the English search terms.

Physicians who died after contracting COVID-19 from patient care activities or interactions with medical colleagues were included. The doctor’s age, practice focus, gender, country and the date of the report were recorded. Physicians who died from a cardiac event in the line of duty, or over 90 years of age were also noted, but not included in the final database. Data were analyzed using Stata 15.1.

MD Death COVID-19

RESULTS

On PubMed search on April 5, 2020, no articles on physician deaths and COVID-19 were found. Our internet search found 193 physician deaths related to COVID-19 infection due to front-line work or interactions with work colleagues. The date of the reports ranged from February 7, 2020, to April 5, 2020. Complete age details were only available on 149 physicians. The Italian National Federation of Medicine Surgery and Odontology⁽²⁾ had a complete list of physician deaths in the country from COVID-19. The deaths in other countries required compilation from numerous web articles. Two physicians caring for COVID-19 patients were thought to die from cardiac compromise or exhaustion but were not diagnosed to have COVID infection, and were excluded from the database.⁽³⁾⁽⁴⁾ A doctor that died from COVID infection acquired during travel rather than frontline-work or work colleagues was also excluded.⁽⁵⁾

Physicians older than 90 years of age were excluded from this study. The age details were missing for 49 individuals. The average age of the physicians that died was 63.5 years (range 28 to 90 years) and the median age was 66.0 years. Physicians 57 years of age or older accounted for three-quarters of COVID-related deaths.

Ninety percent (175/194) of the deceased physicians were male. General practitioners and emergency room doctors (78/192), respiriologists (5/192), internal medicine specialists (11/192) and anesthesiologists (6/192) comprised 52% of those dying. Two percent of the deceased were epidemiologists (4/192), 2% were infectious disease specialists (4/192), 4% were ENT (8/192), 4% were ophthalmologists (7/192), and 5% were dentists (9/192). [See Table 1]

MD Death COVID-19

Twenty-two percent (42/191) of the physicians practiced a surgical specialty with average age 63.4 years, compared to their primary care or medicine colleagues of average age 63.6 years.

There was no statistically significant difference between the ages of the surgeons and non-surgeons. (p=0.96)

The countries with the most reported physician deaths were Italy (79/198; 40%), Iran (43/198; 22%), China (16/198; 8%), Philippines (14/198; 7%), United States (9/198; 5%), Indonesia (7/198; 4%) and France (6/198; 3%). [See Table 2]

DISCUSSION

Death in the line of duty is the doctor's ultimate sacrifice, which may be compounded when physicians unknowingly infect family members.⁽⁶⁾ The general public may not comprehend the importance of self-isolation measures to contain the COVID-19 pandemic until a physician dies fighting the virus.⁽⁷⁾

We acknowledge the limitations of this paper. The number of physician deaths from COVID-19 is likely under-reported given the rapidly changing course of the pandemic, and because national mortality figures may not be available or accurately reported if all patients are not tested. Although reliance on social media searches is suboptimal, it may be the only accessible source of information, especially in countries with limited press freedom. We could not discern if the physicians died from COVID-19 or underlying conditions with associated viral infection. Pre-existing medical morbidities were not uniformly reported. The paper does not examine the number of physicians infected with COVID, who have not died; nor does it enumerate the mortality or our nursing and allied health colleagues.

MD Death COVID-19

Physician deaths from COVID-19 may vary between countries due to the time of disease outbreak, varying public health resources, governmental policies and controls to enforce quarantine and social distancing and mask wear, the amount of testing performed, ascertainment bias, available medical supplies and technology and social greeting habits.⁽⁸⁾ Nations such as Singapore, South Korea and Taiwan that exercised decisive action to prevent travel from affected regions, strict enforcement of quarantines and widespread testing contained the epidemic and there are few social media reports of physician deaths.⁽⁹⁾ South Korea had no physician or nurse deaths from COVID-19 until 10 weeks after their disease outbreak.⁽¹⁰⁾⁽¹¹⁾ As the disease onset in North America and the United Kingdom lagged behind Asia and Europe, the coming weeks may reveal a rise in COVID-19 related physician deaths in these new regions. On April 5, 2020 there was at least twelve COVID-19-related physician deaths in North America. An increasing number of North American physicians have contracted COVID-19 and are in critical care.⁽¹²⁾

Physicians from almost all the medical specialties from psychiatry to urology have succumbed to work-related COVID-19. Physicians working in the airway such as dentists, otorhinolaryngologists, and anesthesiologists are especially at risk for COVID-19 infection and this group comprised 12% of all physician deaths. Dentists are in close proximity to oral secretions for prolonged periods and their high-speed handpiece and ultrasonic instruments aerosolize body fluids. In our review 5% of the fatalities were in dentists. However, in a recent paper from China⁽¹³⁾ no dentists were reported to die from COVID-19 contracted during patient encounters. Ophthalmologists also work for extended periods of time close to oronasal secretions. Dr. Li Wenliang, the ophthalmologist from China who first alerted the world to COVID-19, died from the disease at the age of 33 years. Subsequently, two more ophthalmologists at Li's workplace passed from COVID-19, perhaps due to prolonged proximity

MD Death COVID-19

to the airway of infected patients during ophthalmoscopy, tear transmission of the virus or from nasolacrimal manipulations.

Lack of personal protective equipment (PPE) and inadequate PPE were commonly cited as a cause of death especially in developing nations and Italy.⁽¹⁴⁾ When PPE is available, proper donning and doffing techniques are required. If adequate manpower is available work teams with a primary examiner, safety monitor, and scribe may decrease the risk of inadvertent contamination.

Patients who lied about their travel history of infectious contacts have also been attributed to physician deaths from COVID-19.⁽⁹⁾ Mandatory passport inspections during pandemics might avert the former. Meticulous public health investigations and expeditious location of all contacts assisted by smartphone tracking might prevent the latter.

Purported risk factors for severe disease and death in COVID-19 include older age, male gender, hypertension, diabetes mellitus, cardiovascular disease, chronic lung disease and immunocompromise.⁽¹⁵⁾ Senior physicians and those with comorbidities ideally should not be assigned to front-line work with COVID-19 patients, but instead duties such as video or phone assessments, consulting or public liason.⁽¹⁶⁾

Italian physicians have suggested that a community-centred or home care system for COVID-19 rather than a hospital-focused system might decrease the transmission of disease and physician exposure.⁽¹⁷⁾

Patient monitoring technologies that track pulse oximetry and vital signs and medical robots allow doctors and nurses to remotely assess and treat infected patients can enhance patient care and decrease risks to health care workers. At present robots that take temperatures, deliver food

MD Death COVID-19

and supplies, and disinfect rooms have been described.⁽¹⁸⁾ However, in countries without resources for even gloves or masks, robots are wishful thinking.

In summary, physicians from almost all medical specialties have succumbed to COVID-19, and all require task-appropriate personal protective PPE. We are in the early phase of the pandemic and the number of physician fatalities will increase. Doctors who were 57 years of age or older accounted for three-quarters of COVID-19-related deaths. If senior or retired physicians are recalled to work during the COVID-19 crisis,⁽¹⁹⁾ consideration should be made to place them away from the front line due to the increased risk of mortality, and the increased likelihood of burden to the medical system if they become infected.

MD Death COVID-19

Table 1. Reported Physician Deaths from COVID-19 by Practice Specialty and Median Age (n=198) on April 5, 2020

SPECIALTY	FREQUENCY (%)	MEDIAN AGE (years)
General Practitioner / Emergency Room	78 (40.6%)	67
Medicine	11 (5.8%)	70
Respirology	5 (2.6%)	70
Anesthesiology	6 (3.1%)	68
Epidemiology	4 (2.1%)	66
Infectious Disease	4 (2.1%)	64
Forensics	3 (1.6%)	65
Microbiology	1 (0.5%)	.
Psychiatry	6 (3.1%)	64
Pediatrics	3 (1.6%)	64
Cardiology	7 (3.7%)	68
Hematology	3 (1.6%)	63
Oncology	4 (2.1%)	46
Neurology	2 (1.6%)	34
Hepatology	1 (0.5%)	69
Gastroenterology	1 (0.5%)	29
Transplant medicine	2 (1.0%)	60
Radiology	1 (0.5%)	43
Physiatrist	1 (0.5%)	68
Occupational Therapy	1 (0.5%)	61
Otorhinolaryngology	8 (4.2%)	61
Ophthalmology	7 (3.7%)	57
Dentistry	9 (4.7%)	71
General surgery	6 (3.1%)	63
Obstetrics & Gynecology	6 (3.1%)	59
Neurosurgery	3 (1.6%)	70
Cardiac surgery	1 (0.5%)	.
Orthopedics	1 (0.5%)	54
Urology	2 (1.0%)	66
Plastic surgery	1 (0.5%)	62
Unknown	8 (4.0%)	.

MD Death COVID-19

Table 2. Reported Physician Deaths from COVID-19 by Country (n=198) on April 5, 2020

Country	Frequency (%)	Median Age (Years)
Italy	79 (39.9%)	69
Iran	43 (21.7%)	54
China	16 (8.1%)	51
Philippines	14 (7.1%)	62
USA	9 (4.6%)	67
Indonesia	7 (3.5%)	58
France	6 (3.0%)	67
Spain	6 (3.0%)	59
United Kingdom	4 (2.0%)	66
Brazil	2 (1.0%)	53
Mexico	2 (1.0%)	45
Turkey	2 (1.0%)	67
Canada	1 (0.5%)	62
Egypt	1 (0.5%)	50
Greece	1 (0.5%)	-
Honduras	1 (0.5%)	56
Pakistan	1 (0.5%)	26
Poland	1 (0.5%)	-
Serbia	1 (0.5%)	59
South Korea	1 (0.5%)	60

MD Death COVID-19

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Johns Hopkins University & Medicine. Coronavirus COVID-19 Global Cases by the Center for Systems Science and Engineering (CSSE) at Johns Hopkins University (JHU). [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 March 24]. Available from: <https://coronavirus.jhu.edu/map.html>.
2. Fedarazione Nazionale degli Ordini del Medici Chirurghi e degli Odontoiatri. Elenco dei Medici caduti nel corso dell'epidemia di Covid-19. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 Mar 27]. Available from: <https://portale.fnomceo.it/elenco-dei-medici-caduti-nel-corso-dellepidemia-di-covid-19/>.
3. Wang H. Anti-epidemic doctors in Hubei received more than 3,000 consultations in one month. Sudden death at home was not identified as a work-related injury. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 March 24]. Available from: https://www.guancha.cn/politics/2020_02_26_538527.shtml.
4. N. K. TEMPO.CO Hero's Award Honored for Medics Who Passed Away to COVID-19. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 Mar 24]. Available from: <https://en.tempo.co/read/1322938/heros-award-honored-for-medics-who-passed-away-to-covid-19>.
5. Channel News Asia (CNA). Malaysian doctor who had COVID-19 dies. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 Mar 24]. Available from: <https://www.channelnewsasia.com/news/asia/covid-19-death-malaysian-doctor-travel-12564804>.
6. Weise K. New York Times. Doctors Fear Bringing Coronavirus Home: 'I Am Sort of a Pariah in My Family'. [Online].; 2020 [cited March 24 2020]. Available from: <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/03/16/us/coronavirus-doctors-nurses.html>.
7. Channel News Asia. France toughens lockdown penalties as coronavirus kills doctor. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 Mar 24]. Available from: <https://www.channelnewsasia.com/news/world/coronavirus-france-doctor-death-economy-workers-covid-19-12565294>.
8. Blackwell T. Financial Post. Why the COVID-19 death rate varies dramatically from country to country. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 Mar 24]. Available from: <https://nationalpost.com/news/why-the-covid-19-death-rate-varies-dramatically-from-country-to-country>.
9. Xinghui K. This Week in Asia. Why are there so few coronavirus infections in Singapore's health workers? [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 Mar 28]. Available from: <https://www.scmp.com/week>

MD Death COVID-19

[asia/health-environment/article/3077345/coronavirus-why-so-few-infections-singapores-health](https://www.asia.com/health-environment/article/3077345/coronavirus-why-so-few-infections-singapores-health).

10. Yoon D. The Wall Street Journal. How South Korea Solved Its Acute Hospital-Bed Shortage. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 Mar 24. Available from: <https://www.wsj.com/articles/how-south-korea-solved-its-acute-hospital-bed-shortage-11584874801>.
11. Yonhap News Agency. Doctor infected with COVID-19 dies in S. Korea. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 April 3. Available from: <https://en.yna.co.kr/view/AEN20200402007400320>.
12. Kirsch T. The Atlantic. CORONAVIRUS: COVID-19 What Happens If Health-Care Workers Stop Showing Up? [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 Mar 24. Available from: <https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2020/03/were-failing-doctors/608662/>.
13. Meng L., Hua F., Bian Z. Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19): Emerging and Future Challenges for Dental and Oral Medicine. Journal of Dental Research. 2020 Mar 12; [Online ahead of print].
14. Salvatori G. Euronews. Italian doctor dies of coronavirus after working without gloves due to shortage. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 March 24. Available from: <https://www.euronews.com/2020/03/18/italian-doctor-dies-of-coronavirus-after-working-without-gloves-due-to-shortage>.
15. Jordan RE., Adab P., Cheng KK. Covid-19: risk factors for severe disease and death. BMJ. 2020 March; 368(m1198).
16. Buerhaus PJ, Auerbach DI, Staiger DO. Older Clinicians and the Surge in Novel Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19). JAMA. 2020 March 30, 2020 (published online ahead of print).
17. Nacoti M., Ciocca A., Giupponi A, Brambillasca P., Lussana F., Pisano M., Goisis G., Banacina D., Fazzi F., Naspro R. NEJM Catalyst. At the Epicenter of the Covid-19 Pandemic and Humanitarian Crises in Italy: Changing Perspectives on Preparation and Mitigation. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 March 24. Available from: <https://catalyst.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/CAT.20.0080>.
18. Yang GZ, Nelson BJ, Murphy RR, Choset H, Christensen H, Collin SH. Robots and Society. Combating Covid-19 - The role of robotics in managing public health and infectious disease. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 Mar 25. Available from: <https://robotics.sciencemag.org/content/5/40/eabb5589>.
19. Hume T. Vice.com. Italian Doctors Are Coming Out of Retirement to Treat Coronavirus — And Dying. [Online].; 2020 [cited 2020 March 24. Available from: https://www.vice.com/en_ca/article/v74jwm/italian-doctors-are-coming-out-of-retirement-to-treat-coronavirus-and-dying.

MD Death COVID-19

Copyright: Edsel Ing has the right to grant on behalf of all authors and does grant on behalf of all authors, an exclusive licence (or non exclusive for government employees) on a worldwide basis to the BMJ Publishing Group Ltd to permit this article (if accepted) to be published in BMJ editions and any other BMJ PGL products and sublicences such use and exploit all subsidiary rights, as set out in our licence

Competing Interest Statement: All authors have completed the Unified Competing Interest form (available on request from the corresponding author) and declare: no support from any organisation for the submitted work [or describe if any]; no financial relationships with any organisations that might have an interest in the submitted work in the previous three years [or describe if any], no other relationships or activities that could appear to have influenced the submitted work [or describe if any]." Please note: The corresponding author must collect Unified Competing Interest forms from all authors and summarise their declarations as above within the manuscript. You do NOT need to send copies of the forms to the BMJ.

Transparency Declaration: Edsel Ing affirms that the manuscript is an honest, accurate, and transparent account of the study being reported; that no important aspects of the study have been omitted; and that any discrepancies from the study as planned (and, if relevant, registered) have been explained.

MD Death COVID-19